

1 NIALL P. McCARTHY (SBN 160175)
2 nmccarthy@cpmlegal.com
3 JUSTIN T. BERGER (SBN 250346)
4 jberger@cpmlegal.com
5 COTCHETT, PITRE & McCARTHY
6 San Francisco Airport Office Center
7 840 Malcolm Road, Suite 200
8 Burlingame, California 94010
9 Telephone: (650) 697-6000
10 Facsimile: (650) 692-3606

11 Attorneys for Plaintiffs and the Class
12 (Other Counsel listed on signature page)

13 PETER SULLIVAN (SBN 101428)
14 PSullivan@gibsondunn.com
15 SAMUEL G. LIVERSIDGE (SBN 180578)
16 SLiversidge@gibsondunn.com
17 CHRISTOPHER CHORBA (SBN 216692)
18 CChorba@gibsondunn.com
19 GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP
20 333 South Grand Avenue
21 Los Angeles, California 90071
22 Telephone: (213) 229-7000
23 Facsimile: (213) 229-7520

24 Attorneys for Defendant,
25 HEWLETT-PACKARD COMPANY

26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65
66
67
68
69
70
71
72
73
74
75
76
77
78
79
80
81
82
83
84
85
86
87
88
89
90
91
92
93
94
95
96
97
98
99
100
101
102
103
104
105
106
107
108
109
110
111
112
113
114
115
116
117
118
119
120
121
122
123
124
125
126
127
128
129
130
131
132
133
134
135
136
137
138
139
140
141
142
143
144
145
146
147
148
149
150
151
152
153
154
155
156
157
158
159
160
161
162
163
164
165
166
167
168
169
170
171
172
173
174
175
176
177
178
179
180
181
182
183
184
185
186
187
188
189
190
191
192
193
194
195
196
197
198
199
200
201
202
203
204
205
206
207
208
209
210
211
212
213
214
215
216
217
218
219
220
221
222
223
224
225
226
227
228
229
230
231
232
233
234
235
236
237
238
239
240
241
242
243
244
245
246
247
248
249
250
251
252
253
254
255
256
257
258
259
260
261
262
263
264
265
266
267
268
269
270
271
272
273
274
275
276
277
278
279
280
281
282
283
284
285
286
287
288
289
290
291
292
293
294
295
296
297
298
299
300
301
302
303
304
305
306
307
308
309
310
311
312
313
314
315
316
317
318
319
320
321
322
323
324
325
326
327
328
329
330
331
332
333
334
335
336
337
338
339
340
341
342
343
344
345
346
347
348
349
350
351
352
353
354
355
356
357
358
359
360
361
362
363
364
365
366
367
368
369
370
371
372
373
374
375
376
377
378
379
380
381
382
383
384
385
386
387
388
389
390
391
392
393
394
395
396
397
398
399
400
401
402
403
404
405
406
407
408
409
410
411
412
413
414
415
416
417
418
419
420
421
422
423
424
425
426
427
428
429
430
431
432
433
434
435
436
437
438
439
440
441
442
443
444
445
446
447
448
449
450
451
452
453
454
455
456
457
458
459
460
461
462
463
464
465
466
467
468
469
470
471
472
473
474
475
476
477
478
479
480
481
482
483
484
485
486
487
488
489
490
491
492
493
494
495
496
497
498
499
500
501
502
503
504
505
506
507
508
509
510
511
512
513
514
515
516
517
518
519
520
521
522
523
524
525
526
527
528
529
530
531
532
533
534
535
536
537
538
539
540
541
542
543
544
545
546
547
548
549
550
551
552
553
554
555
556
557
558
559
560
561
562
563
564
565
566
567
568
569
570
571
572
573
574
575
576
577
578
579
580
581
582
583
584
585
586
587
588
589
590
591
592
593
594
595
596
597
598
599
600
601
602
603
604
605
606
607
608
609
610
611
612
613
614
615
616
617
618
619
620
621
622
623
624
625
626
627
628
629
630
631
632
633
634
635
636
637
638
639
640
641
642
643
644
645
646
647
648
649
650
651
652
653
654
655
656
657
658
659
660
661
662
663
664
665
666
667
668
669
670
671
672
673
674
675
676
677
678
679
680
681
682
683
684
685
686
687
688
689
690
691
692
693
694
695
696
697
698
699
700
701
702
703
704
705
706
707
708
709
710
711
712
713
714
715
716
717
718
719
720
721
722
723
724
725
726
727
728
729
730
731
732
733
734
735
736
737
738
739
740
741
742
743
744
745
746
747
748
749
750
751
752
753
754
755
756
757
758
759
760
761
762
763
764
765
766
767
768
769
770
771
772
773
774
775
776
777
778
779
780
781
782
783
784
785
786
787
788
789
790
791
792
793
794
795
796
797
798
799
800
801
802
803
804
805
806
807
808
809
810
811
812
813
814
815
816
817
818
819
820
821
822
823
824
825
826
827
828
829
830
831
832
833
834
835
836
837
838
839
840
841
842
843
844
845
846
847
848
849
850
851
852
853
854
855
856
857
858
859
860
861
862
863
864
865
866
867
868
869
870
871
872
873
874
875
876
877
878
879
880
881
882
883
884
885
886
887
888
889
890
891
892
893
894
895
896
897
898
899
900
901
902
903
904
905
906
907
908
909
910
911
912
913
914
915
916
917
918
919
920
921
922
923
924
925
926
927
928
929
930
931
932
933
934
935
936
937
938
939
940
941
942
943
944
945
946
947
948
949
950
951
952
953
954
955
956
957
958
959
960
961
962
963
964
965
966
967
968
969
970
971
972
973
974
975
976
977
978
979
980
981
982
983
984
985
986
987
988
989
990
991
992
993
994
995
996
997
998
999
1000

In re: HP INKJET PRINTER LITIGATION

Master File No. C05-3580 JF

**~~{PROPOSED}~~ ORDER PRELIMINARILY
APPROVING CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT,
CONSOLIDATING CASES FOR
SETTLEMENT PURPOSES,
PROVISIONALLY CERTIFYING A
NATIONWIDE SETTLEMENT CLASS,
APPROVING PROPOSED NOTICE, AND
SCHEDULING FAIRNESS HEARING**

This Document Relates To:

All Actions

Upon review and consideration of the Stipulation of Settlement, and the attachments thereto, which have been filed with the Court, it is HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED and DECREED as follows:

1. The Court has carefully reviewed the Stipulation of Settlement, as well as the files, records, and proceedings to date in this matter. The definitions in the Stipulation of Settlement are hereby incorporated as though fully set forth in this Order, and capitalized terms shall have the meanings attributed to them in the Stipulation of Settlement.

2. This Order addresses the settlement reached in three separate actions pending before this Court: *In re: HP Inkjet Printer Litigation*, Case No. C05-3580 JF (“*Ciolino*”); *Rich v. Hewlett-Packard Co.*, Case No. C06-03361 JF (“*Rich*”); and *Blennis v. Hewlett-Packard Co.*, Case No. C07-00333 JF (“*Blennis*”). The *Ciolino*, *Rich*, and *Blennis* actions: involve overlapping products, claims, theories, and class members; the relief provided to HP’s customers pursuant to the Stipulation of Settlement is similar for each case; Settlement Class Members are eligible to receive settlement benefits under more than one case based on a single printer purchase; and the parties believe it will be more efficient to administer this settlement in one action rather than in three separate actions. Accordingly, the Court orders that, for purposes of effectuating the settlement and providing notice to the Settlement Class, the *Ciolino*, *Rich*, and *Blennis* actions should be related pursuant to Local Civil Rule 3-12(a) and consolidated pursuant to Rule 42(a) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. The *Ciolino*, *Rich*, and *Blennis* actions (collectively, the “Action”) are hereby consolidated under the following caption going forward:

In re: HP INKJET PRINTER LITIGATION

Case No. C05-3580 JF

3. The parties have agreed to settle the Action upon the terms and conditions set forth in the Stipulation of Settlement, which has been filed with the Court. The Stipulation of Settlement, including all exhibits thereto, is preliminarily approved as fair, reasonable, and adequate. Plaintiffs in the Action, by and through their respective counsel, have investigated the facts and law relating to the matters alleged in their respective complaints, including extensive pretrial discovery, pretrial motions practice, legal research as to the sufficiency of the claims, and an evaluation of the risks associated

1 with continued litigation, trial, and/or appeal. The settlement was reached as a result of extensive
2 arm's length negotiations between counsel for Plaintiffs in the *Ciolino*, *Rich*, and *Blennis* actions, on
3 the one hand, and counsel for HP, on the other hand, occurring over several years and multiple
4 mediation sessions with several respected mediators—the Honorable Daniel Weinstein of JAMS (in
5 the *Ciolino* action), the Honorable James L. Warren of JAMS (in the *Ciolino* action and the *Rich*
6 action), and Alexander S. Polsky, Esq., of JAMS (in the *Blennis* action). The settlement confers
7 substantial benefits upon the Settlement Class, particularly in light of the damages that Plaintiffs and
8 Class Counsel believe are potentially recoverable or provable at trial, without the costs, uncertainties,
9 delays, and other risks associated with continued litigation, trial, and/or appeal.

10 4. The Court conditionally certifies, for settlement purposes only: a class of all
11 individual or entity end-users who purchased or received as a gift in the United States an Affected
12 Model (as defined in the Stipulation of Settlement) from September 6, 2001, to September 1, 2010
13 (the "Settlement Class"). Excluded from the Settlement Class are all persons who are employees,
14 directors, officers, and/or agents of HP or its subsidiaries and affiliated companies, as well as the
15 Court and its immediate family and staff.

16 5. The Court conditionally finds, for settlement purposes only and conditioned upon the
17 entry of this Order and the Final Order and Judgment, and the occurrence of the Effective Date, that
18 the prerequisites for a class action under Rules 23(a) and (b)(3) of the Federal Rules of Civil
19 Procedure have been satisfied in that: (a) the number of Settlement Class Members is so numerous
20 that joinder of all members thereof is impracticable; (b) there are questions of law and fact common
21 to the Settlement Class; (c) the claims of the Plaintiffs are typical of the claims of the Settlement
22 Class they seek to represent for purposes of settlement; (d) the Plaintiffs have fairly and adequately
23 represented the interests of the Settlement Class and will continue to do so, and the Plaintiffs have
24 retained experienced counsel to represent them; (e) for purposes of settlement, the questions of law
25 and fact common to the Settlement Class Members predominate over any questions affecting any
26 individual Settlement Class Member; and (f) for purposes of settlement, a class action is superior to
27 the other available methods for the fair and efficient adjudication of the controversy. The Court also
28 concludes that, because this Action is being settled rather than litigated, the Court need not consider

manageability issues that might be presented by the trial of a nationwide class action involving the issues in this case. *See Amchem Prods., Inc. v. Windsor*, 521 U.S. 591, 620 (1997). In making these findings, the Court has exercised its discretion in conditionally certifying the Settlement Class on a nationwide basis. *See Hanlon v. Chrysler Corp.*, 150 F.3d 1011 (9th Cir. 1998).

6. The Court appoints the law firms of Cotchett, Pitre & McCarthy; Kabateck Brown Kellner, LLP; Berk Law PLLC; Chavez & Gertler LLP; Cuneo, Waldman & Gilbert, LLC; Edelson & Associates, LLC; The Garcia Law Firm; Law Offices of Michael D. Liberty; Law Offices of Scott E. Shapiro, P.C.; McNicholas & McNicholas, LLP; Pearson, Simon, Soter, Warshaw & Penny, LLP; and Seeger Weiss, LLP as counsel for the Class (“Class Counsel”). For purposes of these settlement approval proceedings, the Court finds that these law firms are competent and capable of exercising their responsibilities as Class Counsel. The Court designates named Plaintiffs Daniel Feder, Nicklos Ciolino, Carl K. Rich, David Duran, Jackie Blennis, and David Brickner as the representatives of the Settlement Class.

7. The Fairness Hearing shall be held before this Court on **January 28, 2011**, at 9:00 a.m., to determine whether the Stipulation of Settlement is fair, reasonable, and adequate and should receive final approval. The Court will rule on Class Counsel’s application for an award of attorneys’ fees, costs, and expenses (the “Fee Application”) at that time. Papers in support of final approval of the Stipulation of Settlement and the Fee Application shall be filed with the Court according to the schedule set forth in Paragraph 14 below. The Fairness Hearing may be postponed, adjourned, or continued by order of the Court without further notice to the Settlement Class. After the Fairness Hearing, the Court may enter a Final Order and Judgment in accordance with the Stipulation of Settlement that will adjudicate the rights of the Settlement Class Members (as defined in the Stipulation of Settlement) with respect to the claims being settled.

8. Pending the Fairness Hearing, all proceedings in the Action, other than proceedings necessary to carry out or enforce the terms and conditions of the Stipulation of Settlement and this Order, are stayed.

9. The Court approves, as to form and content, the Long Form Notice of Pendency and Settlement of Class Action (“Long Form Notice”) and Summary Notice, attached as Exhibits “B” and

1 “E,” respectively, to the Stipulation of Settlement. As soon as possible after the entry of this Order,
2 but not later than sixty (60) days after the entry of this Order, HP will coordinate with the Settlement
3 Administrator to provide notice to the Settlement Class as follows:

4 (a) by e-mailing the Long Form Notice substantially in the form attached as
5 Exhibit “B” to the Stipulation of Settlement, to the last known e-mail addresses of the Settlement
6 Class to the extent such e-mail address information exists in HP’s registration database, is a valid e-
7 mail address, and the member of the Settlement Class has not withheld his/her consent to being
8 contacted by HP via e-mail;

9 (b) publishing the Summary Notice in USA WEEKEND, PARADE, PEOPLE, and CIO
10 MAGAZINE publications, and in banner advertisements on Yahoo.com and on other websites through
11 24/7 Real Media Network; and

12 (c) providing a link in the Long Form Notice and the Summary Notice to a
13 settlement website to be designed and administered by the Settlement Administrator that will contain
14 the settlement documents (including but not limited to the Long Form Notice and the Claim Form), a
15 list of important dates, and any other information to which the parties may agree.

16 10. The Court finds that the Long Form Notice and Summary Notice are reasonable, that
17 they constitute due, adequate, and sufficient notice to all persons entitled to receive notice, and that
18 they meet the requirements of due process and Rule 23 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.
19 Specifically, the Court finds that the manner of dissemination of the Long Form Notice and Summary
20 Notice described in Paragraph 9 complies with Rule 23(e) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure as
21 it is a reasonable manner of providing notice to those Settlement Class Members who would be
22 bound by the settlement. The Court also finds that the manner of dissemination of the Long Form
23 Notice and Summary Notice described in Paragraph 9 complies with Rule 23(c)(2), as it is also the
24 best practicable notice under the circumstances, provides individual notice to all Settlement Class
25 Members who can be identified through a reasonable effort, and is reasonably calculated, under all
26 the circumstances, to apprise the members of the Settlement Class of the pendency of this Action, the
27 terms of the settlement, and their right to object to the settlement or exclude themselves from the
28 Settlement Class. *See, e.g., Farinella v. PayPal, Inc.*, 611 F. Supp. 2d 250, 256-57 (E.D.N.Y. 2009)

(court approved plan disseminating notice by email, internet posting, and publication); *In re Grand Theft Auto Video Game Consumer Litig.*, 251 F.R.D. 139, 145 (S.D.N.Y. 2008) (same); *see also Todd v. Retail Concepts, Inc.*, No. 07-0788, 2008 WL 3981593, at *2 (M.D. Tenn. Aug. 22, 2008) (court approved plan disseminating notice by email, in-store posting, and website posting).

11. Settlement Class Members will have until **February 15, 2011**, to submit their Claim Forms, which is due, adequate, and sufficient time.

12. Each Settlement Class member who wishes to be excluded from the Settlement Class and follows the procedures set forth in this Paragraph shall be excluded. Putative members of the Settlement Class who wish to opt out of the settlement must send a letter by fax, U.S. mail, or e-mail in the form specified in the Stipulation of Settlement and Long Form Notice to: HP Inkjet Settlement Administrator, P.O. Box 5270, Portland, OR 97208-5270, postmarked (or the equivalent for fax or e-mail) no later than **January 3, 2011**. All persons or entities who properly elect to opt out of the settlement shall not be Settlement Class Members and shall relinquish their rights to benefits with respect to the Stipulation of Settlement, should it be approved.

13. Any member of the Settlement Class who has not timely submitted a written request for exclusion from the Settlement Class, and thus is a Settlement Class Member, may object to the proposed settlement contained in the Stipulation of Settlement, the certification of the Settlement Class, the proposed settlement contained in this Stipulation of Settlement, the entry of the Final Order and Judgment, the amount of fees requested by Class Counsel, and/or the amount of the incentive awards requested by the named Plaintiffs. Any Settlement Class Member who intends to object to the Stipulation of Settlement must send a written objection by fax, U.S. mail, or e-mail to the Settlement Administrator and send U.S. mail or e-mail a copy to Class Counsel and Defense Counsel at the addresses set forth below postmarked (or the equivalent for fax or e-mail) no later than **January 3, 2011**. Settlement Class Members who fail to file and serve timely written objections in the manner specified above shall be deemed to have waived all objections and shall be foreclosed from making any objection (whether by appeal or otherwise) to the settlement. No Settlement Class Member shall be entitled to be heard at the Fairness Hearing (whether individually or through separate counsel) or to object to the settlement, and no written objections or briefs submitted by any

1 Settlement Class Member shall be received or considered by the Court at the Fairness Hearing, unless
2 written notice of the objecting class member's intention to appear at the Fairness Hearing and copies
3 of any written objections and/or briefs shall have been filed with the Court and served on Class
4 Counsel and Defense Counsel by **January 3, 2011**. Settlement Class Members who object must set
5 forth their full name, current address, and telephone number.

6 Settlement Administrator

7 HP Inkjet Settlement Administrator
8 P.O. Box 5270
9 Portland, OR 97208-5270
10 Facsimile: 877-341-4607
11 E-mail: Info@HPInkjetPrinterSettlement.com

12 Counsel for the Class

13 Niall P. McCarthy
14 Justin T. Berger
15 COTCHETT, PITRE & McCARTHY
16 San Francisco Airport Office Center
17 840 Malcolm Road, Suite 200
18 Burlingame, California 94010
19 Telephone: (650) 697-6000
20 E-mail: jberger@cpmlegal.com
21 Facsimile: (650) 692-3606

22 Brian S. Kabateck
23 Richard L. Kellner
24 Alfredo Torrijos
25 KABATECK BROWN KELLNER LLP
26 644 South Figueroa Street
27 Los Angeles, California 90017
28 Telephone: (213) 217-5000
E-mail: at@kbklawyers.com
Facsimile: (213) 217-5010

Counsel for HP

Samuel G. Liversidge
Christopher Chorba
Dhananjay S. Manthripragada
GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP
333 South Grand Avenue
Los Angeles, California 90071
E-mail: DManthripragada@gibsondunn.com
Facsimile: (213) 229-7520

1 14. Class Counsel shall file their Fee Application on or before **November 29, 2010**.

2 15. Papers in support of final approval of the Stipulation of Settlement, and in response to
3 objections to the Stipulation of Settlement or the Fee Application, shall be filed with the Court on or
4 before **January 14, 2011**.

5 16. In summary, the dates of performance are as follows:

6 (a) The Long Form Notice required to be sent by e-mail to the Settlement Class
7 per the Stipulation of Settlement shall be sent within sixty (60) days after the entry of this Order;

8 (b) The Summary Notice shall be published within sixty (60) days after the entry
9 of this Order;

10 (c) Settlement Class members who desire to be excluded shall submit requests for
11 exclusion postmarked (or the equivalent for fax or e-mail) no later than **January 3, 2011**;

12 (d) All objections to the Stipulation of Settlement and written notices of the
13 objecting class member's intention to appear at the Fairness Hearing shall be filed and served by
14 **January 3, 2011**;

15 (e) Class Counsel shall file their Fee Application on or before **November 29,**
16 **2010**;

17 (f) Papers in support of final approval of the Stipulation of Settlement, and in
18 response to objections to the Stipulation of Settlement or the Fee Application, shall be filed with the
19 Court on or before **January 14, 2011**; and

20 (g) The Fairness Hearing shall be held on **January 28, 2011**, at 9:00 a.m.

21 17. These dates of performance may be extended by order of the Court, for good cause
22 shown, without further notice to the Settlement Class. Settlement Class Members must check the
23 settlement website at www.HPIInkjetPrinterSettlement.com regularly for updates and further details
24 regarding extensions of these dates of performance.

25 18. In the event the Stipulation of Settlement is not approved by the Court, or for any
26 reason the parties fail to obtain a Final Order and Judgment as contemplated in the Stipulation of
27 Settlement, or the Stipulation of Settlement is terminated pursuant to its terms for any reason or the
28 Effective Date does not occur for any reason, then the following shall apply:

(a) All orders and findings entered in connection with the Stipulation of Settlement shall become null and void and have no force and effect whatsoever, shall not be used or referred to for any purposes whatsoever, and shall not be admissible or discoverable in this or any other proceeding;

(b) The conditional certification of the Settlement Class pursuant to this Order shall be vacated automatically, and the Actions shall proceed as though the Settlement Class had never been certified pursuant to this Stipulation of Settlement and such findings had never been made;

(c) The consolidation of the *Ciolino*, *Rich*, and *Blennis* actions pursuant to this Order shall be vacated automatically, and the actions shall return to the procedural status quo before entry of this Order as if no settlement had been negotiated or entered into, and all three actions shall proceed independently and shall be restored to the active docket in accordance with the Stipulation of Settlement;

(d) Nothing contained in this Order is, or may be construed as, a presumption, concession or admission by or against HP or Plaintiffs of any default, liability or wrongdoing as to any facts or claims alleged or asserted in the Action, or in any actions or proceedings, whether civil, criminal or administrative, including, but not limited to, factual or legal matters relating to any effort to certify the *Ciolino*, *Rich*, and *Blennis* cases as class actions;

(e) Nothing in this Order or pertaining to the Stipulation of Settlement, including any of the documents or statements generated or received pursuant to the claims administration process, shall be used as evidence in any further proceeding in this case, including, but not limited to, motions or proceedings seeking treatment of the *Ciolino*, *Rich*, and *Blennis* cases as class actions; and

(f) All of the Court's prior Orders having nothing whatsoever to do with class certification shall, subject to this Order, remain in force and effect.

19. Pending final determination of whether the proposed settlement should be approved, no Settlement Class Member directly, derivatively, in a representative capacity, or in any other capacity, shall commence or continue any action against any of the Released Parties (as that term is

1 defined in the Stipulation of Settlement) in any court or tribunal asserting any of the Released Claims
2 (as that term is defined in the Stipulation of Settlement).

3 20. Epiq Class Action & Claims Solutions, Inc., is hereby appointed as Settlement
4 Administrator for this settlement and shall perform all of the duties of the Settlement Administrator
5 set forth in the Stipulation of Settlement.

6 21. Class Counsel and Defense Counsel are hereby authorized to use all reasonable
7 procedures in connection with approval and administration of the settlement that are not materially
8 inconsistent with this Order or the Stipulation of Settlement, including making, without further
9 approval of the Court, minor changes to the form or content of the Long Form Notice, Summary
10 Notice, and other exhibits that they jointly agree are reasonable or necessary.

11
12 IT IS SO ORDERED, this 1 day of October, 2010

13
14 
15 THE HONORABLE JEREMY FOGEL
16 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT JUDGE
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28